

MARICOPA COUNTY COMMISSION ON TRIAL COURT APPOINTMENTS

MINUTES

May 19, 2015

PRESENT: Justice Robert M. Brutinel, Acting Chair; Barry Aarons; Robert Dalager; Leonard Gilroy; Bill Hughes; Barbara Marshall; Steven Perica; Amanda Reeve, Ron Reinstein; Debra Stark and Don Vogel

ABSENT: Manny Bustamante; Donald Jarnagin; Tommy Richardson and Diane Rosztoczy

Justice Robert Brutinel, Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Introductions

Justice Brutinel introduced himself and noted a quorum of the Commission. He welcomed the Commission members and the public present.

Public Comment

Justice Brutinel explained to the public that the Commission would be screening applications for three vacancies on the Maricopa County Superior Court created by the retirement of Judges Linda Miles, Robert Miles and Boyd Dunn. He then asked for public comment on the applicants. He reminded the speakers that they are limited to three minutes each and asked them not to repeat comments by previous speakers about the same candidate.

Jeremy Mussman spoke on behalf of Stephen Hopkins.
Michael Hamblin spoke on behalf of Mark Hawkins.
David Radosevich spoke on behalf of Eartha Washington.
Donald Kunz spoke on behalf of Joshua Rogers.
Belinda Calloway spoke on behalf of Edward Johnson.
Kristin Martineau spoke on behalf of Edward Johnson.
Carson Emmons spoke on behalf of Michael Blair.
Sean Wilson spoke on behalf of Michael Blair.

Former Commission member Pat McGroder addressed the Commission about his experience on the Commission and the importance of nominating applicants with trial experience. He also explained how recruitment was done during his service and emphasized the role attorneys play in that process.

Approval of Minutes

Justice Brutinel asked if any member wished to submit changes or additions to the draft minutes of the April 14, 2015 meeting. It was moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Disqualifications and Disclosures

Justice Brutinel inquired about any basis for additional disqualification or disclosure not previously mentioned, pursuant to the Commission’s rules regarding conflict of interest or bias.

Ron Reinstein disclosed that he contacted Louis Seletos and encouraged him to apply. Kerstin G. LeMaire, Jeffrey Rueter and Laura Reckart have appeared in front of him.

Don Vogel disclosed that he saw Greg Como shortly and only said hello. He spoke to Aryeh Schwartz regarding the process and had a business conversation with Ronee K. Steiner.

Amanda Reeve disclosed that she has worked with Susan B. Lagerman’s husband before.

Barbara Marshall disclosed that she spoke to Wendy Coy and Michael Anderson regarding the process. Laura Reckart and Michael Anderson are her coworkers and she is recused from voting on them.

Justice Brutinel disclosed that he encouraged Ronee K. Steiner to continue applying.

Discussion of Applicants and Interviews and Selection of Nominees

Justice Brutinel asked for discussion regarding the applicants. The Commission members disclosed references and comments regarding various applicants. He reminded the Commission and the public that he did not vote except in the event of a tie.

A motion to go into executive session was made at 10:24 a.m. the motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session 10:46 a.m.

After further discussion, the Commission suggested a straw vote be taken of all the applicants in alphabetical order. The Commission agreed and the results of the straw vote were:

- | | |
|---------------------------|------------------------|
| Michael Anderson – 4 | Edith Lucero – 8 |
| Julie Ashworth LaFave – 3 | Steven Lynch – 5 |
| Alison Bachus – 10 | Edward Maldonado - 0 |
| Michael Blair – 4 | Julie Mata – 1 |
| Susan Borden Lagerman – 0 | Charles S. McMurry – 0 |
| Theodore Campagnolo – 8 | Laura Reckart - 5 |
| Eric Childs – 0 | Denise Riden – 1 |
| Gregory Como - 9 | Joshua Rogers – 10 |
| Jessica Cotter – 0 | Jeffrey Rueter – 10 |
| Wendy Coy – 6 | Aryeh Schwartz – 10 |
| Michael Gottfried – 1 | Louis Seletos – 9 |
| Mark Hawkins – 4 | Shellie Smith – 8 |

Stephen Hopkins – 10
Jason Johannes – 0
Edward Johnson – 4
Brian Kaiser – 2
Stephen Keist – 0
Kerstin G. LeMaire – 10

Ronee K. Steiner – 10
Alan Tavassoli - 1
Lisa Vandenberg – 8
Eartha Washington – 0
Dena Welch-Rowland – 3
Gerald Williams - 4

There was then a discussion of the applicants in alphabetical order. It was agreed those applicants with a vote of three or more would warrant further discussion and possible nomination to the tentative interview list. Susan Borden Lagerman, Eric Childs, Jessica Cotter, Jason Johannes, Brian Kaiser, Stephen Keist, Michael Gottfried, Edward Maldonado, Julie Mata, Charles S. McMurry, Denise Riden, Alan Tavassoli and Eartha Washington were eliminated from further discussion.

A motion to interview all applicants that received five or more votes to include Michael Anderson who Barbara Marshall was recused on was made. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Theodore Campagnolo and Laura Reckart were removed from this list since the Commission was notified that they had been appointed by the Governor.

Selection of Applicants to be Interviewed

Justice Brutinel opened the floor for individual nominations.

Rob Dalager moved to add Michael Anderson to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed with a vote of 9-0-2 with Justice Brutinel and Barbara Marshall abstaining.

Amanda Reeve move to add Alison Bachus to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Debra moved to add Gregory Como to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Barry Aarons moved to add Wendy Coy to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Rob Dalager moved to add Stephen Hopkins to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Kerstin G. LeMaire to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Leonard Gilroy moved to add Edith Lucero to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Barry Aarons moved to add Steven Lynch to the list to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Ron Reinstein moved to add Joshua Rogers to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Jeffrey Rueter to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Barry Aarons moved to add Aryeh Schwartz to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Louis Seletos to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Debra Stark moved to add Shellie Smith to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Rob Dalager moved to add Ronee K. Steiner to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Barry Aarons moved to add Lisa VandenBerg to the interview list. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Steve Perica moved to close nominations. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The final interview list included the following applicants; **Michael Anderson, Alison Bachus, Gregory Como, Wendy Coy, Stephen Hopkins, Kerstin G. LeMaire, Edith Lucero, Steven Lynch, Joshua Rogers, Jeffrey Rueter, Aryeh Schwartz, Louis Seletos, Shellie Smith, Ronee K. Steiner and Lisa VandenBerg.**

Discussion of Interview Schedule and Interview Questions

The Commission then addressed the logistics of the pending interviews. It was agreed the interview meeting will begin at 8:30 a.m. on June 15, 2015. The Commission recommended 15 minute interviews with a possible hypothetical question. The Commission would use follow-up questions as necessary. Staff was directed to schedule interviews at 15-minute intervals and to make due diligence assignments only for applicants not previously interviewed.

Justice Brutinel encouraged Commission members to submit questions before the interview meeting. The members agreed to discuss the new material and select questions at the meeting on June 15, 2015.

Adjournment

Justice Brutinel thanked the members for their service. It was moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 11:04 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Rob Dalager
Commission Secretary